BOARD OF REGENTS BRIEFING PAPER

Handbook Revision, NSHE Co-Requisite and College-Ready Gateway Policy

BACKGROUND & POLICY CONTEXT OF ISSUE:

At the January 2019 Student Success Summit, the Board heard presentations on the success of corequisite support, including a <u>presentation</u> from Bruce Vandal, Senior Vice President at Complete College America. At the March 2019 meeting, the Board was presented with a <u>policy paper</u> entitled, *Traditional Remediation is Not Working* highlighting that traditional forms of remediation utilized in various forms across the NSHE have low success rates particularly compared to corequisite models used in states like Tennessee. Hearing this information along with an increasing national dialogue on the perils of traditional remediation, the Board requested a policy that mandates corequisite support and eliminates traditional, pre-requisite pathways for remediation. The proposed policy places all students, regardless of actual or perceived under-placement, into a college-level math and English course and, as necessary, a co-requisite course that provides simultaneous remedial support while enrolled in the college-level gateway course.

For students who under current policy are being placed into remedial math and/or English courses, the proposed policy requires institutions to instead offer just-in-time academic support while students are enrolled in a college-level gateway mathematics and/or English course. The policy eliminates long, unsuccessful pathways for students with the highest need for remedial support (e.g. below high school level). National data from Florida, Georgia, Tennessee, California, Colorado, Texas, and West Virginia, as well as research from organizations including the Bill and Melinda Gates Foundation, Complete College America, Education Commission of the States, and Lumina Foundation all support the effectiveness of corequisite support in increasing the number of students who complete the college-level gateway course, as well as student success in subsequent courses, and ultimately improving graduation rates.

Corequisite support is proven to be a successful model for students at all levels of under-preparedness. From students with an ACT of 13 or less to students nearest the college readiness benchmarks, the successes of corequisite support are unmatched by traditional, pre-requisite models of remediation. National data also confirms that adult learners as well as ethnic minorities are no exception to the success of corequisite support. Increasing the seat time and mandating academic support through corequisite models means that students are given the remediation at the time they need it the most—when they are taking the college-level course.

The most challenging subset of the policy's population will be for STEM-interested students who place below high school-level math. National dialogue indicates that while these students may have an initial interest in a STEM-based field, many will change their majors to non-STEM fields. Additionally, creating curriculum that seeks to bridge a student's academic knowledge from a *less than high school level* to *college-level precalculus* (MATH 126) in one semester may be too intensive for the student's benefit. For these reasons, students with less than high school level math may be placed into a co-requisite model of college mathematics fundamentals (MATH 120) or college algebra (MATH 124). Upon completion of this co-requisite course, a STEM-interested student may be able to enroll into a pre-calculus course, but if the student changes to a non-STEM major they will have met the gateway math requirement in one semester.

For institutions seeking to offer experimental programs for a subset of the student population, the proposed policy includes a provision for institutions to request a temporary exception from the policy. This temporary exception (up to a maximum of two years) allows institutions to produce sizable and scalable experimental programs, but experimental programs cannot fully replace the corequisite pathway. Data regarding the experimental program should be collected to determine if the program has the same or higher success rates than the mandated corequisite pathway. Institutions requesting an exception must submit their written request detailing the experimental program as well as information on disparate impact for participants to the Chancellor for feedback and Board of Regents for approval. Proposals for experimental programs beginning on the policy's effective date, Fall 2021, should be submitted to the Board of Regents for approval by December 2019.

SPECIFIC ACTIONS BEING RECOMMENDED OR REQUESTED:

Amend Board policy under *Title 4, Chapter 16, Section 1* to eliminate traditional remediation for degree-seeking students and instead mandate enrollment in college-level math and English courses along with co-requisite support for all students whose English and/or mathematics placement scores place them below college-level courses. In addition, this proposal includes a revision to Title 4, Chapter 16, Section 6, which removes the requirement for students to have completed gateway coursework prior to co-admission.

IMPETUS (WHY NOW?):

In January 2019, the Board of Regents approved the 2025 Student Success Goals, developed by each institution, to increase the number of conferred awards, as well as graduation and retention rates. For each institution to achieve these ambitious goals, they must retain the students that they bring in. NSHE System Administration produced a Math Taskforce report in

<u>April 2015</u> that found that traditional remedial pathways do not result in timely completion of gateway mathematics courses, and that corequisite courses appear to result in much higher rates of successful completion of gateway mathematics in the first year of enrollment, as well as higher rates of degree completion.

Upon an audit of math pathways for the system, some institutions require remediated students to complete as many as four courses of remediation before enrolling into a college-level course. In addition, remedial courses that are deemed less than high school level (below MATH 95) do not count toward a student's enrollment level for federal student aid purposes. The proposed policy gives every student the opportunity to complete their college-level gateway math and English courses in their first semester of enrollment while receiving financial support for these courses. According to national data, this will not only result in more students completing gateway math and English courses, but it will also decrease the time-to-degree as compared to traditionally-remediated students. Also important, apart from saving on the financial cost of remedial coursework, there is a psychological effect provided by the corequisite model which affirms to students they can stay on track to graduate and not be forced into long, complex remediation pathways.

Finally, in April 2019, the NSHE Office of Academic and Student Affairs hosted three Corequisite Policy forums to gather feedback from institutional stakeholders. Attendees were given a brief presentation on the current challenges with traditional remediation, as well as an overview of the proposed policy and possible strategies for implementation. Feedback and suggestions for policy revisions were heard and some acted upon, including an exception for students with disabilities, as well as concerns regarding certificate-seeking students. These forums were useful for understanding the scope of effect of the policy and potential successes, as well as anticipated implementation challenges.

CHECK THE NSHE STRATEGIC PLAN GOAL THAT IS SUPPORTED BY THIS REQUEST:

- □ Access (Increase participation in post-secondary education)
- X Success (Increase student success)
- X Close the Achievement Gap (Close the achievement gap among underserved student populations)
- □ Workforce (Collaboratively address the challenges of the workforce and industry education needs of Nevada)
- □ Research (Co-develop solutions to the critical issues facing 21st century Nevada and raise the overall research profile)
- **I** Not Applicable to NSHE Strategic Plan Goals

INDICATE HOW THE PROPOSAL SUPPORTS THE SPECIFIC STRATEGIC PLAN GOAL

Traditional remedial education is ineffective and the dropout rate of students who place and enroll into traditional remedial education is very high. Corequisite support ensures students earn college-level credit within their first semester of enrollment. Both NSHE and national data indicate that students who complete their college-level mathematics and/or English course within the first year of enrollment have a much higher likelihood of earning a certificate or degree.

With two-thirds of NSHE community college students and one-quarter of NSHE university students placing into remediation, many of whom are ethnic minorities, coupled with the low success rates of current modes of remediation, there is a moral imperative to close the achievement gap and support historically underrepresented students through corequisite support.

BULLET POINTS TO SUPPORT REQUEST/RECOMMENDATION:

- Graduation rates for remediated students are as low as 1% in the system and too many remediated students drop out and never complete gateway math and English courses.
- Many of the system's ethnic minorities are placed into traditional remedial courses, which typically have very low completion rates and ultimately result in low graduation rates.
- The policy proposal eliminates traditional remediation and requires institutions to place students in a college-level course with co-requisite support where students earn college-level math and English credit within their first semester of enrollment, rather than current pathways that may require up to four semesters of remedial coursework.

POTENTIAL ARGUMENTS AGAINST THE REQUEST/RECOMMENDATION:

• At the policy forums hosted in early April 2019, the following implementation challenges were presented:

- Some faculty at the community colleges do not currently have the credentials required to teach college-level (100 or above) courses and there are concerns that recruiting additional master's-prepared faculty will be challenging.
- Some faculty strongly believe that students with the highest remediation needs (those placing below MATH 95) cannot succeed in corequisite courses and need multiple courses to gain the knowledge necessary to succeed in college-level gateway courses.

ALTERNATIVE(S) TO WHAT IS BEING REQUESTED/RECOMMENDED:

None have been presented

RECOMMENDATION FROM THE CHANCELLOR'S OFFICE:

The Chancellor's Office recommends approval of the policy as proposed.

COMPLIANCE WITH BOARD POLICY:

- Consistent With Current Board Policy: Title #_____ Chapter #_____
- X Amends Current Board Policy: Title 4, Chapter 16, Section 1
- Amends Current Procedures & Guidelines Manual: Chapter #_____ Section #_____
- Other:
- X Fiscal Impact: Yes_X_ No_

Explain: ____Adopting full-scale co-requisite remediation models will have a fiscal impact that will be determined through the implementation phase and will be presented to the Board when action plans are presented to the Board prior to the Fall 2021 effective date.

Section #

POLICY PROPOSAL Title 4, Chapter 16, Section 1 NSHE Co-Requisite and College-Ready Gateway Policy Effective Fall 2021

Additions appear in *boldface italics*; deletions are [stricken and bracketed]

Section 1. <u>NSHE [Placement] Co-Requisite and College-Ready Gateway Policy</u>

[The placement policies of the Nevada System of Higher Education (NSHE) are intended to ensure a foundation of knowledge and competencies that will assist students in successfully pursuing and attaining an academic degree. Students are strongly encouraged to prepare for the rigors of higher education prior to entering the NSHE.]

- 1. Pursuant to federal regulations, institutions may make ability-to-benefit determinations using federally approved tests and passing scores to receive federal student aid. The NSHE reserves the right to cancel the admission or registration of any individual whose attendance at a university or college, in the opinion of the appropriate administrative officer and the President, would not be mutually beneficial, as determined by the ability-to-benefit test, to that individual and the university or college.
- 2. Initial Placement of Students into English and Mathematics Courses.
 - a. <u>Continuous Enrollment Requirement.</u> Upon initial enrollment all degree-seeking students must be enrolled in a college-level or co-requisite gateway English and/or mathematics course or the equivalent for a certificate program (e.g. embedded curriculum) until the institutional core curriculum English and mathematics requirements are completed.
 - b. <u>Remediation Exceptions.</u> Except as otherwise provided, effective Fall 2021, traditional forms of remediation, including courses numbered below 100, shall not be offered independently at any NSHE institution.
 - i. College-preparatory courses (numbered below 100) may be offered to high school students.
 - ii. Remedial courses (numbered below 100) may be offered when they serve as a mandatory co-requisite for a gateway course and are described as such in the institutional course catalog and in the NSHE common course numbering system.
 - c. [Exemption from Remedial Instruction.] College-Ready Placement. Degree-seeking and certificate seeking students who meet or exceed the minimum English or mathematics scores on any one of the college readiness assessments [listed below] provided for herein must be placed into a college-level course in that subject and are exempt from being placed into any form of [remedial] co-requisite instruction in that subject provided that the student:
 - i. Was continuously enrolled in an English course and a mathematics course in his or her senior year of high school unless an exception is approved by an NSHE institution; and

 Enrolls in an NSHE institution after high school in any term (summer/fall/winter/spring) during the academic year following high school graduation.

Institutions may use other factors including high school transcript[5] and grade point average to determine placement. [, or additional] Alternate testing (e.g., ALEKS) to determine the appropriate first college-level course may be utilized for higher placement or if the college readiness assessment provided for herein was not taken by the student within three years prior to the date of matriculation. [Institutions are not required to honor initial placement decisions pursuant to this subsection for students who fail to remain continuously enrolled in required mathematics and English courses until the core mathematics and English requirements are completed.]

College Readiness Assessments – English <i>Benchmarks</i>	
Test Score	Minimum Score
ACT English or ACT English Language Arts (ELA)	18 (English) or 20 (ELA)
SAT Critical Reading – SAT Test Date Prior to March 2016	500
SAT Evidence-Based Reading and Writing – SAT Test Date March 2016 and later	480
Smarter Balanced	2583 (Achievement Level 3)
PARCC	Level 4 Score

College Readiness Assessments – Mathematics Benchmarks	
<u>Test Score</u>	Minimum Score
ACT Mathematics	22
SAT Math – SAT Test Date Prior to March 2016	500
SAT Math – SAT Test Date March 2016 and later	530
Smarter Balanced	2628 (Achievement Level 3)
PARCC	Level 4 Score

[b-] d. Placement of Students Who Do Not Meet College-Readiness Benchmarks [without an Exemption from Remedial Instruction. For degree] Degree-seeking and certificate seeking students who have not met the English or mathematics college readiness assessment score on one of the tests in subsection [a] c shall be placed and enrolled in the college-level course or a co-requisite course, not to exceed six credits. Alternate testing (e.g., ALEKS) to determine the appropriate first college-level course may be utilized for higher placement or if the college readiness assessment provided for herein was not taken by the student within three years prior to the date of matriculation. Credit and non-credit skills development curriculum may be provided as supplemental instruction for those students enrolled in a co-requisite gateway course only. An institution shall not require a student who has completed a co-requisite course to take a placement test for enrollment in a subsequent course. [or who have not taken any of the tests in subsection a, institutions must develop an assessment and placement policy that ensures students who place at high school or above levels have an opportunity to enroll in and complete gateway college courses in mathematics and English within one academic

year. The assessment and placement policy may use multiple measures, including, but not limited to placement exams; high school GPA; course selection and performance in the senior year of high school; and intended postsecondary program of study to determine appropriate placement into one the following options:

- i. Placement into college-level courses without any additional academic support or remediation;
- ii. Placement into a co-requisite course where academic support is provided to students while enrolled in college-level gateway courses;
- iii. Placement into a single semester of remedial education that is followed by either a gateway college-level course or co-requisite gateway course option; or
- iv. For students who are seeking a STEM (science, technology, engineering or mathematics) degree or program of study that requires college algebra or pre-calculus and who place at the high school Algebra 1 level (e.g. Math095), placement into a three-semester sequence culminating in the gateway college algebra course. The sequence may include co-requisite coursework.
- e. Students enrolled in the summer term prior to matriculation shall not be permitted to enroll in traditional remediation courses over the summer term.
- [e.] f. [Institutions may establish] Students with documented disabilities may be placed on alternative pathways to those described in subsection d upon the written recommendation of the disability resource center [b for those degree-seeking students whose mathematics or English skills are below the high school level as established by the institution's assessment and placement policy set forth in subsection b.]
- 3. <u>Experimental Programs</u>. Institutions may request a temporary exemption from co-requisite enrollment for a defined student population for the purpose of experimental programs that seek to improve gateway course completion and degree completion. Institutions must submit a written proposal for an exception detailing the cohort size, description of experimental program, disparate impact analysis for participants, proposed metrics for program evaluation, and a defined period of time for the experimental program not to exceed two years. The Chancellor shall review the initial proposal and provide feedback to the institution after which the proposal must be submitted to the Board of Regents for review and consideration prior to implementation. [To promote completion of gateway courses within the first academic year, all degree-seeking students must be continuously enrolled in appropriate mathematics and English courses until the institutions may authorize exceptions to this requirement if the exception does not affect the student's ability to complete the gateway course within the first academic year.]
- 4. [Requirements] *Criteria* for [college readiness and] *placement into a* college-level course *with and without corequisite support* [enrollment] shall be publicized by each institution to the appropriate Nevada school districts. In addition, the Chancellor will work with the State Superintendent of Public Instruction *and the district superintendents* to publicize these requirements to all Nevada school districts and to establish educational strategies to encourage high school standards, graduation requirements, and assessments that are aligned with college and workforce readiness expectations.
- 5. For purposes of this section, *the terms stated here have the following meanings:*
 - *a.* "[e]*C*ollege-level *course*" means courses that are numbered 100-level and above *and fulfill gateway course requirements*[-];

- b. "Co-requisite course" means a college-level gateway course numbered 100-level and above where academic support is provided simultaneously in the same semester. Co-requisite courses do not include a.) course modules that are scheduled sequentially in the same term, including but not limited to accelerated courses; and b.) courses with curriculum taught over more than one semester, including but not limited to stretch courses.
- c. "Remedial course" means a course that is below college-level and numbered below 100-level.
- 6. Periodically, the Chancellor's Office will audit institutions for compliance with these provisions and will report such finding to the Board.

POLICY PROPOSAL TITLE 4, CHAPTER 16, SECTION 6 Simultaneous Admissions Effective Upon Passage

Additions appear in *boldface italics*; deletions are [stricken and bracketed]

Section 6. Simultaneous Admissions

- Admission Guarantee. Students seeking admission to a university whose high school grade point average or test scores are insufficient for admission will be offered enrollment at [either] a NSHE community college [or state college] with a subsequent guarantee of admission to the universities or state college under the transfer criteria established in Title 4, Chapter 14.
- 2. Co-Admission. A university or *state* college may establish a program to co-admit a degree seeking NSHE community college student if the student [÷
 - a. Is] *is* in good academic standing [at all NSHE institutions] and planning to complete a baccalaureate degree [; and
 - b. Completed at least one college-level English and one college-level mathematics course].

Students must apply to the university or college of choice for co-admission and meet the requirements set by that institution. Students accepted into the program will receive academic advising from both institutions, but the community college will be the home campus for purposes of financial aid and data reporting.